House ? The Committee on Paper Laid on the Table should also take care of this.

RE. RELIEF TO EARTHQUAKE VICTIMS OF LATUR

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR (Nominated) : Madam, I am raising a serious issue regarding earthquake relief to the people of Latur. Madam, time and again allegations were made and at our instance some officers were suspended for pillaging the did material that was received from different countries. Even after this, the work and the relief that is to be given to the earthquake affected people has not been stream-linSd. May I point out that the medical aid that was received—the life saving drugs—are today, being sold in the Sholapur market. The foodgrains that were received are easily available in the Nanded market. Warm clothes and blankets that were received are easily available in Belgaum and Nippani markets. Furthermore, Government had sanctioned about Rs. 10 lakhs to one officer by the name of Viala, to buy utensils for distribution among the people. My information is that only Rs. 1 lakh was spent for buying these materials. There were two Deputy Collectors who had refused to register it saying that it was a small quantity and it was not the required quantity. After this, the two Deputy Collectors who had refused were transferred from Osmanabad District. Somebody else was sent there. We took up this matter with the authorities and an enquiry was instituted. But nothing has happened and the officer has not been suspended. Discussions are taking place at other places and the people who offered help are saying that what happened in Kashi should not happen here. In the case of Uttarkashi, materials were found at all places. Today, our worry is that the material received in Latur should not find way to other markets. I would like to know from the Home Minister about the kinds of aid that were received from foreign Governments and the agencies which are controlled by the Government of India.

At least those who are taking on the watch-dog respoflsfbility can see to it that these materials reach the poor people. Thank you.

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya) : The Government should make ac enquiry into this and come to the House with a statement. What Mr. Ambedkar an has said is shocking.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, I would like to associate myself with Mr. Ambedkar who raised a very sensitive and an important issue. It is tragic and pathetic that the relief provided to the quake victims should be misued and that the Government should remain a passive spectator. The Leader of the House and Home Minister should offer to make a statement on this question before the House adjourns before dusk.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE AND THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN) : Madam, I j will pass on this information to the j Minister of Agriculture. I don't think the Ministry of Home Affairs has anything to do with this. I will pass on this information to the Minister of Agriculture. He will look into the matter and then come before the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Actual ly, you are the Home Minister as well as the Leader of the House. I think that is the crisis because on anything happen ing anywhere in this country or outside. they feel that the Home Minister should take charge. ..*(Interruptions).*

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Maharashtra) : He knows about the foreign aid.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :... .and that the Leader of the House is responsible for everything happening anywhere. . *{Interruptions')*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Foreign aid is monitored by the Home Minister. That is how the Home Ministry comes into the picture.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Even otherwise, about things which do not concern the Home Minister also, we always ask him. .. *{Interruptions)*

SHRI G. G. SWELL : It may not be his responsibility but it comes within his purview. .. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : Also because it is the home of the Home Minister. .. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. G. SWELL : You can't shut your eyes from all these things.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : The concerned Ministry will be making a statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He will convey.' He has a dual responsibility; as Leader, he will convey and coming from Maharashtra, he is concerned, and as Home Minister, he has to catch the cul prits. .. *(Interruptions)*

श्री एस. एस. अहलूवालिया (बिहार) : महोदया, कल जे.पी.सी. की रिपोर्ट पर चर्चा करते हुए विभिन्न वक्ताओं ने अपने वक्तव्य और अपने विचार रखे हैं और मुझे बहुत अफसोस है कि हमारे इस सदन के एक गुणी, ज्ञानी और पंडित डा. मुरली मनोहर जोशी जी ने देश की अर्थ व्यवस्था के बारे में कुछ रिमार्क्स ऐसे डाले हैं जो बड़े दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण हैं, बड़े शर्मनाक हैं।.... (व्यवधान) जो अनपार्लियामेंटरी हैं।..... (व्यवधान)

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam, I have an objection. .. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VIREN J. SHAH (Maharashtra) : Have we started the debate on JPC ? *(Interruptions)* Has the discussion start ed ? .. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM : How can we discuss about the speech of an hon. Member of this House ? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VIREN J. SHAH : During the discussion, he can reply to the points raised by any Member.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The point is, he is not participating in the discussion. .. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Maharashtra) : What is he doing right now ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. When he wanted to raise this, I told him, "Mr. Ahluwalia, why don't you raise it in the discussion." Then I realised that he was a Member of the JPC. So, he is not participating. .. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : Supposing I am not participating... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Ahluwalia, are you speaking on the debate ?

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : No.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He is not speaking on the debate. .. *(Interruptions)*

श्री सुरेश पचौरी (मध्य प्रदेश) : इसमें क्या आपत्ति है, सुनिए जरा। आप मजमून तो सुनिए।

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : Madam, this is a strange situation where persons j who are not participating in the discus-sion speak under the guise of Zero Hour,Special Mentions or personal exolanations . . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VIREN J. SHAH : He cannot react to a speech here.. *(Interruptions)*

श्री एस.एस अहलूवालिया : महोदया, यह एक ऐसा मुद्दा है जो भारत माता पर एक बहुत बड़ा आरोप है और मैं समझता हूं कि इस सदन का कोई भी सदस्य भारत माता की अस्मिता पर..... (व्यवधान)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : It is a strange convention in this House. .. *{Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will not permit. ..*(Interruptions).* Just a minute. I assure you that I will not per mit anything about the JPC discussion. Let me hear what he wants to say. If he says anything which should not go on record, I will protect the Members right. But let me first hear what he says. I have no idea. .. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : He is discussing about the points made by Dr. Joshi. Everybody has a right to respond. Why can't he respond then ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What point are you raising

SHRI VIREN J. SHAH : Madam, the question that we want to ask is : Is he talking about any point arising out of the discussion ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Are you making a point ? *(Interruptions)* Arc you replying to Mr. Joshi ? What are you doing ?

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : I am re-gisterins my objection to some remarks he made about our motherland, about our Mother India. I am talking about those remarks. It is a serious matter.. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondi-cherry) : It is a very serious matter and those remarks should be expunged from the records.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will go through the record. ..*(Interruptions).*

श्री एस. एस. अहलूवालिया: महोदया, हर चीज बर्दाश्त की जा सकती है, लेकिन भारत माता को कोई गाली निकाले, भारत माता को कोई.... (व्यवधान).... वह बर्दाश्त के बाहर है।

श्री दिलीप सिंह भूरिया (मध्य प्रदेश) महोदया, यह देश को बेचकर खा गए।... (व्यवधान).....

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : There is a parliamentary procedure. Dr. Joshi failed to follow that.. .*(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let me find out. I will look into the record. I have the records with *me..(Interruptions)* ..

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: मैडम, मेरा पाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है। जीरो अवर अथवा स्पेशल मेंशन उस विषय में प्रयोग किए जाते हैं जोकि अर्जेंट पब्लिक इंटरेस्ट के हों.... (व्यवधान)....

श्री एस. एस. अहलूवालिया: पूरे देश में मातृभूमि से ज्यादा क्या इम्पोर्टेन्ट है। भारत माता से ज्यादा इम्पोर्टेन्ट क्या है।

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : Was ho j sleeping yesterday ? Was his party sleep-j ing yesterday ?.. *(.Interruptions)*.. .

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR : It is not a matter of urgent public im-portance. .. *(Interruptions)* .. .

श्री एस. एस. अहलूवालिया: महोदया, आज अखबारों में छपा है... (व्यवधान)...

श्री प्रमोद महाजन: जब जोशी जी बोल रहे थे तो क्या ये लोग सो रहे थे ?

श्री सुरेश पचौरी: महोदया, भारतीय संस्कृति का अपमान किया है डा. मुरली मनोहर जोशी ने। उन्होंने ऐसा जाल बिछाया है ...(व्यवधान)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: मैडम, यह जीरो अवर में नहीं आ सकता।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Which page in the record are you referring to ?

श्री एस. एस. अहलूवालिया : मैडम, मुरली मनोहर जोशी ने अपने भाषण में कहा.... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : The question is, whatever Dr. Joshi has spoken, it is on the record. You please go through it.. *{interruptions)..*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : 1 am asking the page.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : -Madam, he need not educate you.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : You go through the records. If you find something objectionable, then you can expunge those remarks.

SHRI V NARAYANASAMY : Dr. Joshi should apologize to this House.. *{interruptions)..*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order in the House please, *.{interruptions)..*

श्री संघ प्रिया गौतम : मैडम, डा. जोशी जब बोल रहे थे तब ये लोग सदन में मौजूद थे, उस समय क्यों इन्होंने एतराज नहीं किया ? क्या ये सो रहे थे उस समय ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit down. When Dr. Joshi was speaking, I was not there and it is generally.. *{Interruptions)..* .I was not there. Don't get agitated. I was not there when he was speaking. I am talking about myself. When I was not there, I don't know what he spoke whether Mr. Ahluwalia was there or not... (व्यवधान)..

अच्छा आपकी बात मैंने मान ली कि वह थे।

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : Can a Member who was absent the day before come and talk now ?. .. *{interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have not gone through the records of whoever spoke yesterday. 1 don't know what Mr. Ahluwalia is mentioning, *.{interruptions)* ...

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : क्या इस पीरियड पर जीरो अवर में डिस्कसन हो सकता है ?

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM : He has taken.. *(interruptions)...*

श्री एस. एस. अहलूवालिया : मैडम, मुझे डा. जोशी के पूरे भाषण पर कोई आपत्ति नहीं है... (व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If Dr. Murli Manohar Joshi has not said anything, I would protect, *.(interruptions)...* I don't know, I was not there. I have to find out. I will look into the record and see what he has said. Otherwise, I will have to read the whole speech of Joshi Ji ... *(interruptions),.. I don't know that* Mr. Ahluwalia is speaking. How do I know ?

श्री एस एस. अहलूवालिया : लेकिन उन्होंने जिन शब्दों का प्रयोग किया है, उन शब्दों का प्रयोग जे.पी.सी. की रिपोर्ट पर नहीं किया जा सकता।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, please ...*(Interruptions)..,.* Just a minute.. *(Interruptions).* .I will go through the record and if I find those words which you are mentioning please come to my Chamber and tell me what those words ar]e—I will remove them from the record... *(lnterruptpns).*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA -.please page No. 1015.. *(Interruptions)* . .You set. page No. 1015.. *(Interruptions).* .Madam, you see page No. 1015.. *(Interruptions)* .. Let me complete my sentence.,*(Interruptions).* .*you* please sec Madam page No. No. 1015.. .*(Interruptions)..*I am telling you the page number... *(Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a. minute, please.. *(Interruptions)..*

आप लोग बैठ जाइए, प्लीज ।. . . . ((व्यवधान)

After my ruling, there is no point.. *(Interruptions).*

आप बैठिए ।. . . . (व्यवधान) . . . . .एक सेकेण्ड आप बैठिए ।. . . . (व्यवधान) . . . .

The second thing is that, today, Dr. Joshi is not here and our procedure is that if we are mentioning about someone, a Member, then we have to see that

he is there because he can explain if he has said something. He shout come today.. *(Interruptions)* ..

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : He is in Patna.. *(Interruptions)* ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What ? ., *(Intemuptiom)*..

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : He is in Patna.. *(Interruptions)* ..

वह तो पटना चले गए, महोदया । यह सदन का बहुत बड़ा अपमान है और इस सदन के माध्यम से भारत-माता का अपमान किया गया। उन्होंने कहा कि ..... (व्यवधान) .....

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री (उत्तर प्रदेश) : नहीं,। नहीं । ..... (व्यवधान) ... ।

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : मैडम, इसे आप देखिए .... (व्यवधान) ....

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया : मैडम, पेज नंबर 1015 पर आप देखिए। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री : आप आकर चैम्बर में बोलिए। आपको जो कुछ बोलना है, चैम्बर में आकर आप बोल सकते हैं। (व्यवधान) चैम्बर में इनको जो कुछ बोलना है वहां जाकर बोले। .. (व्यवधान)...

श्री कृष्ण लाल शर्मा (हिमाचल प्रदेश) : मैडम मुझे कुछ बात करनी है। आप हमें इजाजत दें। ... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : Madam, we have objection to what Mr. Madan Bhatia said about what Dr. Joshi spoke. Are you allowing me to speak on that ? .. *{Interruptions)* .. We too have an ob-junction to that.. *(Interruptions)*.."

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I won't allow anybody.. *(Interruptions)* ..

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया : मैडम, पेज नंबर 1015 पर आप देख लीजिए ... (व्यवधान) ..

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री : मैडम, अहलुवालिया साहब बोले जा रहे हैं, जबकि आपकी इनको अनुमति नहीं मिली है। बिना अनुमति के अहलुवालिया साहब नहीं बोल सकते हैं। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री सत्यनारायण जटिया (मध्य प्रदेश) : पूरे देश को पता चल गया है और यहां .... (व्यवधान) ....

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया : शर्म की बात नहीं आ रही। .... (व्यवधान) .... अभी भी शर्म नहीं आई। जनाजा निकल गया भोपाल में, शर्म नहीं आई .... (व्यवधान) ....।

उप सभापति : बैठ जाइए, प्लीज .. (व्यवधान) ..।

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया : मैडम, यह भाजपा का अपमान है। भारत माता की अस्मिता पर एक बहुत बड़ा प्रश्न-चिह्न लगाया है ... (व्यवधान) .. भारत माता की अस्मिता पर इन्होंने प्रश्न चिह्न लगाया है यह बर्दाश्त के बाहर है। ... (व्यवधान) .. यह बात लोगों ने टेलीकास्ट करके मुझे बताई। इतनी बड़ी बात निकाली इन्होंने भारत माता की और हम लोग यहां मूकदर्शक बनकर सुन रहे हैं। यह डूब मरने के काबिल है। ... (व्यवधान) ...।

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग (मध्य प्रदेश) : अहलुवालिया जी बैठ जाइए। आपके बस का काम नहीं है भारत माता की इज्जत बचाना। .. (व्यवधान) ...

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया : इनके लिए खराब नहीं हो सकता है क्योंकि यह तो परिपक्व है, यह सब करते रहते हैं। .... (व्यवधान) ....।

विपक्ष के नेता श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : जरा अंग्रेजी पढ़ना दीजिए, इनको, मैडम।

[شری سکندر بخت : زرا انگریزی پڑھوا دیجئے انکو میڈم ۔]

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया : अंग्रेजी आप पढ़िए। किस अंग्रेजी में लिखा है यह। .... (व्यवधान ....।

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग : आप लोग तो देश को बेच खाइये। टुकड़े-टुकड़े कर दीजे देश के। .... (व्यवधान) ....।

उपसभापति : अभी आप बैठ जाइए।

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया : महोदया यह देश का मुद्दा है, जिसके लिए डा. मुरली मनोहर जोशी इस सदन के माध्यम से भारत माता से माफी मांगें। .... (व्यवधान) ....

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री: माननीय उपसभापति जी, महलुवालिया जी आपकी आज्ञा के बिना बोलते रहेंगे तो हम लोग भी बोलेंगे और फिर हम भी आपकी आज्ञा नहीं मानेंगे। ··(व्यवधान)··।

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया: मैडम, आप एस्योर कीजिए हाउस को, कि आप रिकार्ड देखकर उस पर कार्यवाही करेंगी। ...(व्यवधान)...।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have seen the record. Our procedure is that we have to have the Member against whom or about whom we are referring anything. He is not here. We should not break our rules. You were hurt, you said. So, we permitted you. Now you have had your say. I will see the record. I will go into the whole thing, not only one line, I will also see in what context anything is being said. So, I thinks now you should be satisfed. Now, Mr. Pramod Mahajan.

अभी यह मामला खत्म, अभी कोई नहीं बोलेगा। इस मामले पर मत बोलिए।

RE. : INCLUSION OF BIOGRAPHY OF SHRI LALOO PRASHAD YADAV IN THE TEXT BOOKS IN BIHAR

श्री प्रमोद महाजन (मध्य प्रदेश) : उपसभापति महोदया, मैं बिहार सरकार, बिहार के मुख्यमंत्री लालू प्रसाद यादव और जनता दल को हार्दिक बधाई देने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूं। विद्यार्थी दशा जीवन की सबसे संस्कारक्षम दशा होती है। इस आयु में मनुष्य के जीवन पर जो भी संस्कार बनते हैं, व जीवन का संबल होते हैं। इस दृष्टि से यह महत्वपूर्ण है कि बिहार के विद्यार्थियों पर अच्छे संस्कार की दृष्टि से बिहार सरकार ने 8वीं कक्षा में विद्यार्थियों को वर्तमान मुख्य मंत्री लालू प्रसाद यादव की जीवनी पढ़ाने का प्रारम्भ किया है।

उप सभापति जी, मैं अभी तक ··(व्यवधान)··

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, what has it got to do with this House ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not know.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I am rather..

SHRI VIREN J. SHAH (Maharashtra) : It is a Centre-State subject. It is of a textbook.

श्री प्रमोद महाजन: मैडम हम बधाई भी नहीं दे सकते किसी को? ·· (व्यवधान)·· मैडम, आपने मुझे अनुमति दी है, अगर मैं व्यवस्था के खिलाफ बोल रहा हूं तो इसमें व्यवधान डालें, नहीं तो जयपाल जी को जो कुछ बोलना है, मेरे बाद बोलें। ···(व्यवधान)···आलोचना करनी है कि इस प्रकार नहीं करनी चाहिए था तो वह मेरे बोलने के बाद करें ...(व्यवधान)...।

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I do not consider it..

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : She has permitted me. I am not yielding.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I am rising on a point of order, Madam.

श्री प्रमोद महाजन: मैडम, यह ठीक नहीं है। आपने मुझे अगर अनुमति दी है तो मुझे पहले बोलने दिया जाए, बोलने के बाद उनको जो कहना है कहें। ···(व्यवधान)···।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Are you speaking against anybody ?

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : I am not speaking against anybody.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I am rising on a point of order, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is your point of order ?

श्री विष्णुकांत शास्त्री(उत्तर प्रदेश) : कितना अच्छा काम, इतने अच्छे पुरुष का जीवन, यह तो प्रशंसा की बात है। ...(व्यवधान)...।

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, I am raising... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : उप सभापति जी, मेरी बात पहले आप सुन लीजिए, फिर आप अनुमति दीजिए। गलत कहने के पहले ही अगर कोई आपत्ति ले ले ...(व्यवधान) ...